

1 Michael Gerard Fletcher (State Bar No. 070849)  
 2 mlfletcher@frandzel.com  
 3 Tricia L. Legittino (State Bar No. 254311)  
 4 tlegittino@frandzel.com  
 5 FRANDZEL ROBINS BLOOM & CSATO, L.C.  
 6 6500 Wilshire Boulevard  
 7 Seventeenth Floor  
 8 Los Angeles, California 90048-4920  
 9 Telephone: (323) 852-1000  
 10 Facsimile: (323) 651-2577  
 11  
 12 Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counterdefendant  
 13 Dynamic Finance Corporation

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56

57

58

59

60

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68

69

70

71

72

73

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97

98

99

100

101

102

103

104

105

106

107

108

109

110

111

112

113

114

115

116

117

118

119

120

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

149

150

151

152

153

154

155

156

157

158

159

160

161

162

163

164

165

166

167

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175

176

177

178

179

180

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

199

200

201

202

203

204

205

206

207

208

209

210

211

212

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

220

221

222

223

224

225

226

227

228

229

230

231

232

233

234

235

236

237

238

239

240

241

242

243

244

245

246

247

248

249

250

251

252

253

254

255

256

257

258

259

260

261

262

263

264

265

266

267

268

269

270

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280

281

282

283

284

285

286

287

288

289

290

291

292

293

294

295

296

297

298

299

300

301

302

303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

324

325

326

327

328

329

330

331

1 proceeding as against Dynamic pursuant to Bankruptcy Code § 7012(b) and Federal Rule of Civil  
2 Procedure Rule 12(b)(6). Each of these claims is barred by the applicable statute of limitations as  
3 set forth in 11 U.S.C. §546(a), and thus fails to state a cause of action upon which relief can be  
4 granted. This Motion is based upon this Notice of Motion and Motion, the Memorandum of  
5 Points and Authorities attached hereto, and upon such other and further oral and documentary  
6 evidence as may be presented at or prior to the time of the hearing on this motion.

**PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE THAT LOCAL BANKRUPTCY RULE 9013-4 REQUIRES A FORMAL RESPONSE TO THIS MOTION AT LEAST FOURTEEN (14) DAYS BEFORE THE HEARING ON THIS MOTION.**

FRANDZEL ROBINS BLOOM & CSATO, L.C.  
MICHAEL GERARD FLETCHER  
TRICIA L. LEGITTINO

By: /s/Michael Gerard Fletcher  
MICHAEL GERARD FLETCHER  
Attorneys for Counter-Defendant Dynamic Finance  
Corporation

## **MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES**

I.

## **INTRODUCTION**

4 Dynamic is the Counterdefendant in the above-referenced adversary action to Counter-  
5 Plaintiff Richard M. Kipperman's ("Trustee") Counterclaims. The Trustee's First though Ninth  
6 Counterclaims are a day late and a dollar short, or more accurately well over 2 years late, as the  
7 last day to seek to avoid Dynamic's liens and advance these Counterclaims was February 27, 2006  
8 (two years after the order for relief was entered --- February 27, 2004 as admitted by the Trustee,  
9 Counterclaim, ¶ 1, page 2, line 6). The Trustee's attempt to bring these Counterclaims against  
10 Dynamic, at this late juncture, is without merit, and moreover barred by the applicable statute of  
11 limitations set forth in Bankruptcy Code §546(a). Accordingly, each of these Counterclaims  
12 should be dismissed for failing to state a cause of action upon which relief can be granted in  
13 accordance with Bankruptcy Code §7012(b) and Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(b)(6).

III.

## ARGUMENT

**THE APPLICABLE STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS PERIOD FOR THE TRUSTEE TO  
ADVANCE COUNTERCLAIMS HAS EXPIRED.**

19 The Trustee predicates his First Through Ninth Counterclaims upon Fraudulent Transfer  
20 pursuant to §§544(b) and 548(a)(1) and (2) of the Bankruptcy Code (Counterclaims at ¶¶13  
21 through 30). The applicable statute of limitations period with respect to these sections is set forth  
22 in 11 U.S.C. §546(a) which states in pertinent part:

23 An action or proceeding under sections 544, 545, 547, 548, or 553  
of this title may not be commenced after the earlier of-

(1) The later of =

- (A) Two years after the entry of the order for relief; or
- (B) One year after the appointment or election of the first trustee under sections 702, 1104, 1163, 1202, or 1302 of this title if

**such appointment or such election occurs before the expiration**  
**of the period specified in sub-paragraph (A); or**

(2) The time the case is closed or dismissed. [Emphasis added.]

Courts will generally find the language of a statute to be "conclusive of its meaning except in the most extraordinary circumstances." *In re Hanna* 72 F3d 114 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1995). The plain wording of §546(a) makes clear that the applicable statute of limitations period begins to run from the date the order for relief was entered, and that all Fraudulent Conveyance claims must have been asserted within two years of that date.

Accordingly, these claims are wholly barred and should not be considered by this Court.

The Trustee will likely try to argue that under *Committee v. Commodity Credit (In re KF Dairies)*, 143 B.R. 734 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 1992) and *El Paso v. America West (In re America West)*, 217 F.3d 1161 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2000) that the Trustee is entitled to maintain his Counterclaims 1-9. The Trustee's likely arguments in that regard are wrong.

First, Counterclaims 1-9 seek affirmative relief against Dynamic. Each seeks avoidance of a transfer to Dynamic or a lien claimed by Dynamic. *See, USA v. Shaltry (In re Home America)*, 232 F.3d 1046, 1051, fn. 7 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2000) (noting, "... the general rule that statutory time-bars are inapplicable to **matters of defense, where no affirmative relief is sought**" distinguishing *Committee*).

Second, no Ninth Circuit case has analyzed such a situation in the context of a Fraudulent Transfer claim under either section 548 or 544. Such claims by definition require affirmative relief. Their sole purpose is to unwind a transfer. Liens generally ride through bankruptcy unaffected. Avoidance of a pre-petition lien requires an affirmative act, one that is here time barred. While a deficiency claim may be subject to the foregoing rules, a fully secured claim is not. As noted in the analogous situation in *USA, supra*, where the Ninth Circuit applied the time bar of section 549 to bar a trustee's attempt to avoid a post-petition exercise of pre-trustee discretion, "Because this action cannot be characterized as one only for a tax refund when the refund claim itself is predicated upon the Trustee's affirmative exercise of her avoiding powers,

1 the statute of limitations of § 549(d) is applicable here." *USA v. Shaltry*, 232 F.3d, *supra*, at 1051.  
2 Similarly here, affirmative relief would be required to attack a secured claim that is otherwise  
3 invulnerable to attack at this point, because any such claim is time barred. Property is no longer  
4 "recoverable," in the words of § 502(d) from Dynamic, without the time barred affirmative act of  
5 avoidance of Dynamic's liens.

6 **II.**

7 **CONCLUSION**

8 Based upon the foregoing, Dynamic respectfully requests that this Motion be granted and  
9 that the Trustee's First through Ninth Counterclaims be dismissed.

10  
11 DATED: April 21, 2008

Respectfully submitted,

12 FRANDZEL ROBINS BLOOM & CSATO, L.C.  
13 MICHAEL GERARD FLETCHER  
14 TRICIA L. LEGITTINO

15 By: /s/Michael Gerard Fletcher  
16 MICHAEL GERARD FLETCHER  
17 Attorneys for Plaintiff and Counterdefendant  
18 Dynamic Finance Corporation

FRANDZEL ROBINS BLOOM & CSATO, L.C.  
6500 WILSHIRE BOULEVARD, 17TH FLOOR  
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90048-4920  
(323) 852-1000

## PROOF OF SERVICE

I, the undersigned, declare and certify as follows:

I am over the age of eighteen years, not a party to the within action and employed in the County of Los Angeles, State of California. I am employed in the office of FRANDZEL ROBINS BLOOM & CSATO, L.C., members of the Bar of the above-entitled Court, and I made the service referred to below at their direction. My business address is 6500 Wilshire Boulevard, Seventeenth Floor, Los Angeles, California 90048-4920.

On April 21, 2008, I served true copy(ies) of the **NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION TO DISMISS TRUSTEE'S COUNTERCLAIMS PURSUANT TO BANKRUPTCY RULE 7012(B) AND FEDERAL RULE OF CIVIL PROCEDURE RULE 12(B)(6); MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF**, the original(s) of which is(are) affixed hereto, to the party(ies) listed on the attached service list.

- BY MAIL:** I am "readily familiar" with the firm's practice of collection and processing correspondence for mailing with the United States Postal Service. Under that practice, it would be deposited with the United States Postal Service that same day in the ordinary course of business. Such document(s) were placed in envelopes addressed to the person(s) served hereunder for collection and mailing with postage thereon fully prepaid at Los Angeles, California, on that same day following ordinary business practices.
- BY FACSIMILE:** At approximately \_\_\_\_\_, I caused said document(s) to be transmitted by facsimile. The telephone number of the sending facsimile machine was (323) 651-2577. The name(s) and facsimile machine telephone number(s) of the person(s) served are set forth in the service list. The document was transmitted by facsimile transmission, and the sending facsimile machine properly issued a transmission report confirming that the transmission was complete and without error.
- BY E-MAIL:** At approximately \_\_\_\_\_, I caused said document(s) to be transmitted by electronic mail. The name(s) and e-mail addresses of the person(s) served are set forth in the service list. The document was transmitted by electronic transmission and without error.
- BY CM/ECF NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING:** I caused said document(s) to be served by means of this Court's electronic transmission of the Notice of Electronic Filing through the Court's transmission facilities, to the parties and/or counsel who are registered CM/ECF Users set forth in the service list obtained from this Court.
- BY OVERNIGHT DELIVERY:** I deposited such document(s) in a box or other facility regularly maintained by the overnight service carrier, or delivered such document(s) to a courier or driver authorized by the overnight service carrier to receive documents, in an envelope or package designated by the overnight service carrier with delivery fees paid or provided for, addressed to the person(s) served hereunder.

I certify under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California and the United States of America that the foregoing is true and correct.

Executed on April 21, 2008, at Los Angeles, California.

/s/Tiffany Lok  
TIFFANY LOK

1 **SERVICE LIST**

2 **BY CM/ECF NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING**

3

4

5

6

- Jeffrey K. Garfinkle jgarfinkle@buchalter.com
- Ali M.M. Mojdehi ali.m.m.mojdehi@bakernet.com,  
janet.d.gertz@bakernet.com;joseph.r.dunn@bakernet.com;monica.j.clipper@bakernet.com  
;sdefile@bakernet.com

7 **VIA U.S. MAIL:**

8 Tiffany L. Carroll  
9 Office of the U.S. Trustee  
402 West Broadway, Suite 600  
10 San Diego, CA 92101

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

FRANDZEL, ROBINS, BLOOM & CSATO, L.C.  
6500 WILSHIRE BOULEVARD, 17TH FLOOR  
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90048-4920  
(323) 852-1000